



**DAVE HILDENBRAND**

29TH DISTRICT  
P.O. BOX 30036  
LANSING, MI 48909-7536

**THE SENATE**  
**STATE OF MICHIGAN**  
APPROPRIATIONS CHAIRMAN

PHONE: (517) 373-1801  
FAX: (517) 373-5801  
senhildenbrand@senate.michigan.gov

**\*\* DRAFT \*\***  
**COMMITTEE MEETING MINUTES**  
**November 30, 2016**

A meeting of the Senate Committee on Appropriations was scheduled for Wednesday, November 30, 2016, at 9:00 a.m., in the Harry T. Gast Senate Appropriations Room of the Capitol Building.

---

The agenda summary is as follows:

1. Reported SB 102 (S-4) (Sen. Pavlov) with recommendation and immediate effect.
2. Reported SB 1177 (Sen. Pavlov) with recommendation and immediate effect.
3. Reported SB 1178 (Sen. Pavlov) with recommendation and immediate effect.

---

The Chairman called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. He instructed the Clerk to call the roll. At that time, the following members were present; Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Hansen, Nofs, Marleau, Stamas, Shirkey, Knollenberg, Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, Knezek and Young, a quorum was present.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. Nofs, supported by Sen. Green, to adopt the meeting minutes from November 9, 2016. Without objection, the minutes were adopted.

The Chairman invited Sen. Pavlov and Kathryn Summers of the Senate Fiscal Agency to summarize SB 102, SB 1177, and SB 1178.

Due to Senate session, the Chairman recessed the committee at 10 a.m.

With all members present, the Chairman reconvened the committee at 10:15 a.m.

The Chairman invited the following individuals to present testimony regarding SB 102, SB 1177, and SB 1178:

Anthony Randazzo and Leonard Gilroy, Reason Foundation – Neutral  
Kerrie Vanden Bosch & Mita Drazilev, DTMB Office of Retirement Services – Oppose  
Peter Spadafore, Michigan Association of School Administrators – Oppose  
Todd Tennis, Coalition for Secure Retirement – Oppose  
Nick Ciaramitaro, AFSCME and Coalition for Secure Retirement – Oppose  
Annie Patnaude, Americans for Prosperity – Support  
Catherine McLogan, Retired Teacher – Oppose  
Julie Rowe, American Federation of Teachers – Oppose  
Eugene Wright, Wayne County Retirees Association – Oppose

The Chairman read the cards of those individuals not wishing to present testimony regarding SB 102, SB 1177, and SB 1178:

Tim Hughes, Michigan AFL-CIO – Oppose  
 Bob Kefgen, Michigan Association of Secondary School Principals – Oppose  
 Jerry Johnson, Calhoun ISD – Oppose  
 John Searles, Midland County ESA – Oppose  
 Mark Guastelle, Michigan Association of Retired School Personnel – Oppose  
 Deb Kadish, Bay-Arenac ISD – Oppose  
 Joe Murphy, Huron ISD – Oppose  
 Brent Holcomb, Lewis Cass ISD – Oppose  
 Jason Mellema, Ionia ISD – Oppose  
 Dr. Scott Koenigh Knecht, Ingham ISD – Oppose  
 Dr. Dave Campbell, Kalamazoo County RESA – Oppose  
 Jeff Mills, Van Buren ISD – Oppose  
 Dr. Lori Tubbergen-Clark, Newaygo County – Oppose  
 Barbara Marshall, St. Joseph ISD – Oppose  
 Bill Black, Teamsters – Oppose  
 Mary Pollack, State Employee Retirees Association – Oppose  
 Annalisa Grunwald, MI Association of Intermediate School Administrators - Oppose  
 Jennifer Smith, Michigan Association of School Boards – Oppose  
 Trica Kinley, Michigan Chamber of Commerce – Support  
 Scott Starr, State Budget Office – Oppose  
 Jonathan Byrd, Michigan Laborers District Council – Oppose  
 Jim Haddad, Michigan Association of Public Employee Retirement Systems – Oppose  
 Caroline Liethen, Department of Education – Oppose  
 Christine Canfield, MEA – Oppose  
 Kathleen Merry, Wayne RESA – Oppose  
 Mary Pollack, American Association of University Women of Michigan – Oppose  
 James Hohman, Mackinac Center – Support  
 Dan Lilienquist, Retirement Security Initiative – Support

At 1:00 p.m. the Chairman recessed the committee.

With all members present, the Chairman reconvened the committee at 2:00 p.m.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. Booher, supported by Sen. MacGregor, to adopt the (S-3) version of SB 102 offered by Chairman Hildenbrand. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Hansen, Nofs, Marleau, Stamas, Shirkey, and Knollenberg

Nays: Sen. (s) Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, Knezek, and Young

The motion prevailed and (S-3) was adopted.

The Chairman explained amendment #2 to the (S-3) version of SB 102.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. MacGregor, supported by Sen. Green, to adopt the Hildenbrand amendment #2 to the (S-3) version of SB 102. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen. (s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Hansen, Nofs, Marleau, Stamas, Shirkey, and Knollenberg

Nays: Sen. Young

Pass: Sen. (s) Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, and Knezek

The motion prevailed and amendment #2 was adopted.

The Chairman recognized Sen. MacGregor to explain amendment #1 to the (S-3) version of SB 102.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. MacGregor, supported by Sen. Proos, to adopt the MacGregor amendment #1 to the (S-3) version of SB 102. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Nofs, Marleau, Stamas, Shirkey, and Knollenberg

Nays: Sen. Young

Pass: Sen. (s) Hansen, Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, and Knezek

The motion prevailed and amendment #1 was adopted.

The Chairman explained amendment #3 to the (S-3) version of SB 102.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. MacGregor, supported by Sen. Green, to adopt the Hildenbrand amendment #3 to the (S-3) version of SB 102. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Hansen, Nofs, Marleau, Stamas, Shirkey, and Knollenberg

Nays: Sen. Young

Pass: Sen. (s) Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, and Knezek

The motion prevailed and amendment #3 was adopted.

The Chairman explained amendment #4 to the (S-3) version of SB 102.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. MacGregor, supported by Sen. Schuitmaker, to adopt the Hildenbrand amendment #4 to the (S-3) version of SB 102. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Hansen, Nofs, Marleau, Stamas, Shirkey, and Knollenberg

Nays: Sen. (s) Hertel, and Young

Pass: Sen. (s) Gregory, Hopgood, and Knezek

The motion prevailed and amendment #4 was adopted.

The Chairman recognized Sen. Knezek to explain amendment #5 to the (S-3) version of SB 102.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. Knezek, supported by Sen. Gregory, to adopt the Knezek amendment #5 to the (S-3) version of SB 102. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Sen. (s) Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel Knezek, and Young

Nays: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Nofs, Marleau, Stamas, Shirkey, and Knollenberg

Pass: Sen. Hansen

The motion failed and amendment #5 was not adopted.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. Proos, supported by Sen. Booher, to report SB 102 (S-3), as amended, as a clean sub, to the floor with recommendation that it pass. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Marleau, Stamas, and Shirkey

Nays: Sen. (s) Hansen, Nofs, Knollenberg, Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, Knezek, and Young

The motion prevailed and SB 102 (S-4) was reported.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. Schuitmaker, supported by Sen. MacGregor, to report SB 1177 to the floor with recommendation that it pass. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Marleau, Stamas, and Shirkey

Nays: Sen. (s) Hansen, Nofs, Knollenberg, Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, Knezek, and Young

The motion prevailed and SB 1177 was reported.

The Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. Schuitmaker, supported by Sen. MacGregor, to report SB 1178 to the floor with recommendation that it pass. The vote was as follows:

Yeas: Chairman Hildenbrand, Sen.(s) MacGregor, Proos, Schuitmaker, Booher, Green, Marleau, Stamas, and Shirkey

Nays: Sen. (s) Hansen, Nofs, Knollenberg, Gregory, Hopgood, Hertel, Knezek, and Young

The motion prevailed and SB 1178 was reported.

There being no further business before the committee, the Chairman entertained a motion by Sen. Nofs, supported by Sen. Booher, to adjourn the meeting at 2:10 p.m. Without objection, the committee was adjourned.

Date Adopted by Committee: